SUMMARY STATEMENT

ITEM NO. DRPA-20-013

SUBJECT: Design Services for PATCO Subway Structure Renovation - Philadelphia

COMMITTEE: Operations & Maintenance

COMMITTEE MEETING DATE: February 4, 2020

BOARD ACTION DATE: February 19, 2020

PROPOSAL: That the Board authorizes staff to negotiate an agreement with Gannett Fleming to provide Design, Bidding and Award, and Construction Support Services for the PATCO Subway Structure Renovation - Philadelphia.

Amount: $1,203,454.00

Consultant: Gannett Fleming

Other Consultants: SJH Engineers, P.C.
ARORA Engineers, Inc.

Engineers Estimate: $1,200,715.00

MBE/WBE Goals: DBE: 15%

Consultant Proposed D/SBE Commitments: DBE: 21.94%

PURPOSE: The purpose of this project is to provide engineering design services required to develop the most feasible and economical renovation alternatives and final design for PATCO Subway Structure of Philadelphia, PA.

BACKGROUND: The Scope of Services the Authority requires includes, but is not limited to, the structural inspection of the subway structure, the design services to develop preliminary and final plans, specifications, and cost estimates for the improvements to PATCO Subway Structure. This will include all design services required to develop drawings and specifications for performing renovation to the tunnel civil and structural, as well as detailed phasing plans with which the Authority may solicit bids for construction.
The Authority publicly advertised its intent to retain a consultant and invited interested firms to submit Statements of Qualifications. Six (6) firms responded with Statements of Qualifications. Four (4) firms were deemed qualified and were sent a formal Request for Proposal. A review committee of Four (4) staff engineers evaluated the Proposals on the basis of Technical merit.

Gannett Fleming and their subconsultants were ranked highest on technical merit. The proposed Project Manager has previous experience with Subway Tunnel renovation projects for different agencies and have a tunnel safety inspection certificate. The firm was involved with PATH Tunnel Inspections and Initial Tunnel Inspection at Queens-Midtown Tunnel, Hugh L. Carey Tunnel, and Inspection and design services for Red Line and Medical Center Crossover Waterproofing. Overall, the team assembled by Gannett Fleming was found to possess the necessary experience and qualifications to successfully complete the project.

In accordance with the Delaware River Port Authority’s qualification based selection procedure, the Cost Proposal was evaluated against the Engineer’s Estimate. Based on this evaluation and subsequent negotiation, Gannett Fleming price was determined to be fair and reasonable.

It is recommended that an engineering services agreement be negotiated with Gannett Fleming for the costs and associated fees not to exceed $1,203,454 to provide engineering services in accordance with the Request for Proposal.

**SUMMARY:**

Amount: $1,203,454.00  
Source of Funds: General Fund and Various FTA Grants  
Capital Project #: PTD.21712  
Operating Budget: N/A  
Master Plan Status: N/A  
Other Fund Sources: Federal Transit Administration (80%)  
Duration of Contract: Design Services, 15 months; Bidding and Award and Construction Support Services, approximately 30 months from issuance of Contractor Notice to Proceed  
Other Parties Involved: N/A  
Estimated Number of JobsSupported: 4
RESOLUTION

RESOLVED: That the Board of Commissioners of the Delaware River Port Authority accepts the Proposal of Gannett Fleming to provide Design Services for PATCO Subway Structure Renovation – Philadelphia and that the proper officers of the Authority be and hereby are authorized to negotiate an Agreement with Gannett Fleming for an amount not to exceed $1,203,454.00, as per the attached Summary Statement; and be it further

RESOLVED: The Chairman, Vice Chairman and the Chief Executive Officer must approve and are hereby authorized to approve and execute all necessary agreements, contracts, or other documents on behalf of the DRPA. If such agreements, contracts, or other documents have been approved by the Chairman, Vice Chairman and Chief Executive Officer and if thereafter either the Chairman or Vice Chairman is absent or unavailable, the remaining Officer may execute the said document(s) on behalf of DRPA along with the Chief Executive Officer. If both the Chairman and Vice Chairman are absent or unavailable, and if it is necessary to execute the said document(s) while they are absent or unavailable, then the Chief Executive Officer shall execute such documents on behalf of DRPA.

SUMMARY:  
Amount:  $1,203,454.00  
Source of Funds:  General Fund and Various FTA Grants  
Capital Project #:  PTD.21712  
Operating Budget:  N/A  
Master Plan Status:  N/A  
Other Fund Sources:  N/A  
Duration of Contract:  Design Services, 15 months; Bidding and Award and Construction Support Services, approximately 30 months from issuance of Contractor Notice to Proceed  
Other Parties Involved:  N/A  
Estimated Number of Jobs Supported:  4
MEMORANDUM

DELAWARE RIVER PORT AUTHORITY
of Pennsylvania & New Jersey

TO: O&M Committee Members
FROM: Michael P. Venuto, Chief Engineer
DATE: January 7, 2020

The Request for Qualifications (RFQs), which was posted on the Authority’s web-site, invited consultants to submit Statements of Qualifications (SOQs). Six (6) firms submitted SOQs on May 14, 2019.

Policy 303a outlines the procedure for Request for Proposal selection of consultants by the Engineering Department. The SOQ evaluation serves as a method for developing a “short list” of firms to receive a Request for Proposal (RFP). The Review Committee evaluated the SOQ’s and recommended soliciting Technical Proposal from the top ranked firms:

- Burns Engineering, Inc.
- Gannett Fleming
- Michael Baker
- Mott MacDonald
- Thornton Tomasetti, Inc.
- WSP USA Inc.

The short listed firms were sent a RFP on July 9, 2019. The Technical Proposals were received on August 23, 2019 from Burns Engineering, Inc., Gannett Fleming Inc., Michael Baker International, and WSP USA, Inc. The Review Committee, consisting of Four (4) staff engineers, reviewed and evaluated the Technical Proposals.

Gannett Fleming and their team of subconsultants were ranked highest on technical merit. The proposed Project Manager and the team presented similar inspection and design services for Red Line and Medical Center Crossover Waterproofing Design (MD & DC), PATH Tunnel Inspections (New York), System wide Tunnels, Shafts and Adits waterproofing design (MD & DC), Initial Tunnel Inspection at Queens-Midtown Tunnel and Hugh L. Carey Tunnel (NY). The technical discussions of both the subway tunnel inspection and repair design was particularly comprehensive and specific relative to those of most of the other proposers. Overall, the team assembled by Gannett Fleming was found to possess the necessary experience and qualifications to successfully complete the project.
The Review Committee recommended that the Cost Proposal be requested from Gannett Fleming and negotiations commence using the Engineer’s Estimate in the amount of $1,200,715.00, as a guide. The Cost Proposal was received on October 18, 2019.

Below are the proposed hours and fees of the top ranked firm, along with the Engineer’s estimate of hours.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Firm</th>
<th>Hours</th>
<th>Original Price Proposal</th>
<th>Negotiated</th>
<th>Fee</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Engineer’s Estimate</td>
<td>6,820</td>
<td>$1,200,715.00</td>
<td>6,820</td>
<td>$1,200,715.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Gannett Fleming</td>
<td>9,007</td>
<td>$1,412,636.00</td>
<td>7,903</td>
<td>$1,203,454.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Cost Proposal from the highest technically ranked firm, Gannett Fleming, dated 10/18/2019 was reviewed by Engineering Department staff. It was observed to be 14% higher than the Engineer’s Estimate due to construction and bidding hours, and the overhead rate submitted by the subconsultants. Negotiations commenced which resulted in a final Cost Proposal in an amount of $1,203,454.00. Based on the Review Committee’s findings the Price Proposal of $1,203,454.00 has been determined to be fair and reasonable and therefore the committee recommends that an Engineering Services Agreement be issued to the highest technically ranked firm, Gannett Fleming.

Based on a review of the Review Committee’s evaluation and supporting documentation, I concur with the recommendation to engage Gannett Fleming of Philadelphia, PA, in the amount of $1,203,454.00 for this Agreement.

:aad