

SUMMARY STATEMENT

ITEM NO.: DRPA-18-003

SUBJECT: Design Services for Ben Franklin Bridge Decorative Lighting Upgrade

COMMITTEE:

Operations & Maintenance

COMMITTEE MEETING DATE:

January 9, 2018

BOARD ACTION DATE:

January 17, 2018

PROPOSAL: That the Board authorizes staff to negotiate an agreement with Urban Engineers to provide Design, Bidding and Award for the Ben Franklin Bridge Decorative Lighting Upgrade project.

Amount: \$294,740.00

Consultant: Urban Engineers

Other Consultants: Modjeski and Masters
Pennoni

Engineers Estimate: \$497,585.00

MBE/WBE Goals: MBE/WBE: 8%

**Consultant Proposed
DBE/WBE Commitments:** DBE/WBE: 30%

PURPOSE: The purpose of this project is to provide design services for the upgrade of the Ben Franklin Bridge decorative lighting systems.

BACKGROUND: The Scope of Services the Authority requires shall include all tasks necessary to design the upgrade and replacement of the current decorative lighting systems and prepare a final design bid package. There are currently two decorative lighting systems on the BFB: (1) Catenary Lighting System from 1987, and (2) Decorative Lighting System from 2000. The Consultant shall design a complete replacement of the current decorative lighting systems such that there is only one Decorative Lighting System, fully integrated together.

The Authority publicly advertised its intent to retain a consultant and invited interested firms to submit Statements of Qualifications. Six (6)

firms responded with Statements of Qualifications on July 14th, 2017. Three (3) firms were deemed qualified and were sent a formal Request for Proposal. A review committee of two (2) staff engineers and the BFB Director evaluated the Proposals on the basis of Technical merit.

Urban Engineers was the highest technically ranked firm and has worked on DRPA facilities for over 20-years. Urban delivered a comprehensive organization chart, proposing personnel with competent project experience. The project examples demonstrated that Urban and The Lighting Practice have a long-standing working relationship and would be a great team for the BFB lighting project. The proposed Project Manager, James Bilella, has been with Urban for over 23-years and has previous experience with bridge lighting.

In accordance with the Delaware River Port Authority's qualification based selection procedure, the Price Proposal was evaluated against the Engineer's Estimate and that of other recommended firms. Based on this evaluation and subsequent discussions with Urban Engineers, the proposed price was determined to be fair and reasonable.

It is recommended that an engineering services agreement be negotiated with Urban Engineers for the costs and associated fees not to exceed \$294,736.96 to provide engineering services in accordance with the Request for Proposal.

SUMMARY:

Amount:	\$294,740.00
Source of Funds:	General Fund
Capital Project #:	BF1904
Operating Budget:	N/A
Master Plan Status:	N/A
Other Fund Sources:	N/A
Duration of Contract:	Design Services, 7 months; Bidding and Award Services, approximately 4 months from issuance of Contractor Notice to Proceed
Other Parties Involved:	N/A
Estimated Number of Jobs Supported:	1.2

RESOLUTION

RESOLVED: That the Board of Commissioners of the Delaware River Port Authority accepts the Proposal of Urban Engineers to provide Design Services for Ben Franklin Bridge Decorative Lighting Upgrade project and that the proper officers of the Authority be and hereby are authorized to negotiate an Agreement with Urban Engineers for an amount not to exceed \$294,736.96 as per the attached Summary Statement; and be it further

RESOLVED: The Chairman, Vice Chairman and the Chief Executive Officer must approve and are hereby authorized to approve and execute all necessary agreements, contracts, or other documents on behalf of the DRPA. If such agreements, contracts, or other documents have been approved by the Chairman, Vice Chairman and Chief Executive Officer and if thereafter either the Chairman or Vice Chairman is absent or unavailable, the remaining Officer may execute the said document(s) on behalf of DRPA along with the Chief Executive Officer. If both the Chairman and Vice Chairman are absent or unavailable, and if it is necessary to execute the said document(s) while they are absent or unavailable, then the Chief Executive Officer shall execute such documents on behalf of DRPA.

SUMMARY:	Amount:	\$294,740.00
	Source of Funds:	General Fund
	Capital Project #:	BF1904
	Operating Budget:	N/A
	Master Plan Status:	N/A
	Other Fund Sources:	N/A
	Duration of Contract:	Design Services, 7 months; Bidding and Award Services, approximately 4 months from issuance of Contractor Notice to Proceed
	Other Parties Involved:	N/A
	Estimated Number of Jobs Supported:	1.2



MEMORANDUM

DELAWARE RIVER PORT AUTHORITY
of Pennsylvania & New Jersey

TO: O&M Committee Members
FROM: Michael P. Venuto, Chief Engineer
SUBJECT: Professional Service Selection for
Design Services for Ben Franklin Bridge Decorative Lighting Upgrade
Technical Proposal Evaluation, Findings and Recommendation Report
DATE: December 7, 2017

The Request for Qualifications (RFQs), which was posted on the Authority's web-site, invited consultants to submit Statements of Qualifications (SOQs). Six (6) firms submitted SOQs on July 14, 2017.

Policy 303a outlines the procedure for Request for Proposal selection of consultants by the Engineering Department. The SOQ evaluation serves as a method for developing a "short list" of firms to receive a Request for Proposal (RFP). The Review Committee evaluated the SOQ's and recommended soliciting Technical and sealed Price Proposals from the top ranked firms: Modjeski and Masters, Pennoni, and Urban Engineers.

The short-listed firms were sent a RFP on September 7, 2017. The Technical Proposals and separate sealed Price Proposals were received on October 12, 2017 from Modjeski and Masters, Pennoni, and Urban Engineers. The Review Committee, consisting of two (2) staff engineers and the BFB Director, reviewed and evaluated the Technical Proposals on October 30, 2017.

Urban Engineers was the highest technically ranked firm and has worked on DRPA facilities for over 20-years. Urban delivered a comprehensive organization chart, proposing personnel with competent project experience. The project examples demonstrated that Urban and The Lighting Practice have a long-standing working relationship and would be a great team for the BFB lighting project. The proposed Project Manager, James Bilella, has been with Urban for over 23-years and has previous experience with bridge lighting.

The Review Committee recommended that the Price Proposal be opened, and negotiations commence using other recommended firm's Price Proposals and the Engineer's Estimate in the amount of \$497,585.00 as a guide. Price Proposals were opened on November 13, 2017.

Below are the Technical Proposal rankings, proposed hours and fees of these firms, along with the Engineer's estimate of hours.

Rank	Firm	Hours	Original Price Proposal	Negotiated	
				Hours	Fee
	Engineer's Estimate	3,247	\$497,585.00		
1	Urban Engineers	2,447	\$294,736.96	2,447	\$294,736.96
2	Modjeski and Masters	5,364	\$739,839.70		
3	Pennoni	3,094	\$422,829.32		

The Price Proposal from the highest technically ranked firm, Urban Engineers, dated October 12, 2017, was reviewed by Engineering Department staff. It was determined that Urban Engineers' cost proposal was 41% lower than the Engineer's estimate and 25% less project hours. Specifically, Urban has 37% less hours for the Preliminary Design Phase and 41% less hours for the Final Design Phase compared to the Engineer's hours. The Project Engineer reviewed the project scope in detail with Urban's project manager to discuss any discrepancies in man-hours compared to the Engineer's estimate. Three assumptions were made by Urban that determined their price proposal.

(1) Urban proposed less man-hours in the existing conditions phase because most of the lighting components will be completely redesigned and/or removed. Most of the existing conditions phase will be to verify any equipment that is remaining in the design.

(2) Based on past project experiences at the Ben Franklin Bridge, Urban was confident that little to no maintenance and protection of traffic (MPT) would be needed during the design of the decorative lighting and that past MPT schedules could be utilized for the construction plans.

(3) The bid and construction phases of a design project can be difficult to estimate; therefore, hours are typically over estimated. However, the DRPA and Urban were able to deliberate on the expectations for these phases and agree on the appropriate number of hours proposed.

After reviewing the project in detail with DRPA, Urban had time to contemplate the design and cost proposals. Urban is confident they proposed a fair and competitive price for the design work needed.

Based on the Review Committee's findings the Price Proposal of \$294,736.96 has been determined to be fair and reasonable and therefore the committee recommends that an Engineering Services Agreement be issued to the highest technically ranked firm, Urban Engineers.

Based on a review of the Review Committee's evaluation and supporting documentation, I concur with the recommendation to engage Urban Engineers of Philadelphia, PA in the amount of \$294,736.96 for this Agreement.

:nco