SUMMARY STATEMENT

ITEM NO. DRPA-12-082
SUBJECT: Design Services for Benjamin Franklin Bridge South Walkway Bicycle & Pedestrian Ramp

COMMITTEE: Operations & Maintenance

COMMITTEE MEETING DATE: September 19, 2012

BOARD ACTION DATE: October 17, 2012

PROPOSAL: That the Board authorizes staff to negotiate an agreement with Ammann & Whitney, Inc. to provide Design Services for the Benjamin Franklin Bridge South Walkway Bicycle & Pedestrian Ramp Project.

Amount: $598,917.00

Consultant: Ammann & Whitney, Inc.

Other Consultants: Pennoni Associates, Inc.
Michael Baker Jr., Inc.
Stantec Consulting Service, Inc.

Engineers Estimate: $610,257.19

PURPOSE: The purpose of this project is to improve accessibility to the South Walkway for bicyclist and pedestrians by replacing the existing stairway in Camden with a bicycle/pedestrian ramp that complies with the requirements of the American with Disabilities Act (ADA). The proposed improvements would facilitate bicycle and pedestrian access between Philadelphia and Camden and encourage the use of alternative modes of transportation (bicycle and pedestrian) for both commute and recreational users. The scope of services includes all design activities required to prepare complete contract documents with which the Authority may solicit bids for construction.

BACKGROUND: Walkways are provided along the north and south sides of the Bridge for pedestrian and bicycle traffic. On the Camden side, both the North and South Walkways terminate at stairways that rise approximately 25 feet above street level, and neither walkway is accessible to individuals who are physically disabled or impaired. Bicyclists are required to walk up the stairs and carry or push their bicycles up and down using steel plates installed on the edge of the steps. Operation’s current policy is to open the South Walkway to the public and use the North Walkway for construction and maintenance activities.
The Authority publicly advertised its intent to retain a consultant and invited interested firms to submit Statements of Qualifications. Fourteen (14) firms responded with Statements of Qualifications on March 7, 2012. Six (6) firms were deemed qualified and were sent a formal Request for Proposal. A review committee of three (3) staff engineers evaluated the Proposals on the basis of Technical merit.

Ammann & Whitney was the highest technically ranked firm. The team proposed by Ammann & Whitney is well qualified and exhibited professional staff knowledgeable in the areas of bridge, architectural, and bicycle/pedestrian facility design. The firm is experienced with similar pedestrian bridge structures and modifications to large bridges. Overall, the team assembled by Ammann & Whitney was found to possess the necessary experience and qualifications to successfully complete the project.

In accordance with the Delaware River Port Authority’s qualification based selection procedure, the Price Proposal was evaluated against the Engineer’s Estimate and that of other recommended firms. Based on this evaluation and subsequent negotiation, Ammann & Whitney’s price was determined to be fair and reasonable.

It is recommended that an engineering services agreement be negotiated with Ammann & Whitney for the costs and associated fees not to exceed $598,917.00 to provide engineering services in accordance with the Request for Proposal.

**SUMMARY:**

- **Amount:** $598,917.00
- **Source of Funds:** General Fund/Subject to Reimbursement from Future Bond Proceeds
- **Capital Project #:** BF1101
- **Operating Budget:** N/A
- **Master Plan Status:** N/A
- **Other Fund Sources:** N/A
- **Duration of Contract:** 270 calendar days
- **Other Parties Involved:** N/A
- **Estimated Number of Jobs Supported:** 3
RESOLUTION

RESOLVED: That the Board of Commissioners of the Delaware River Port Authority accepts the Proposal of Ammann & Whitney to provide Design Services for Benjamin Franklin Bridge South Walkway Bicycle & Pedestrian Ramp Project and that the proper officers of the Authority be and hereby are authorized to negotiate an Agreement with Ammann & Whitney for an amount not to exceed $598,917.00, as per the attached Summary Statement; and be it further

RESOLVED: The Chairman, Vice Chairman and the Chief Executive Officer must approve and are hereby authorized to approve and execute all necessary agreements, contracts, or other documents on behalf of the DRPA. If such agreements, contracts, or other documents have been approved by the Chairman, Vice Chairman and Chief Executive Officer and if thereafter either the Chairman or Vice Chairman is absent or unavailable, the remaining Officer may execute the said document(s) on behalf of DRPA along with the Chief Executive Officer. If both the Chairman and Vice Chairman are absent or unavailable, and if it is necessary to execute the said document(s) while they are absent or unavailable, then the Chief Executive Officer shall execute such documents on behalf of DRPA.

SUMMARY:

| Amount:     | $598,917.00 |
| Source of Funds: | General Fund/Subject to Reimbursement from Future Bond Proceeds |
| Capital Project #: | BF1101 |
| Operating Budget: | N/A |
| Master Plan Status: | N/A |
| Other Fund Sources: | N/A |
| Duration of Contract: | 270 calendar days |
| Other Parties Involved: | N/A |
| Estimated Number of Jobs Supported: | 3 |
MEMORANDUM

DELAWARE RIVER PORT AUTHORITY
of Pennsylvania & New Jersey

TO: O&M Committee Members
FROM: Michael P. Venuto, Director of Engineering/Chief Engineer, Engineering
DATE: September 19, 2012

The Request for Qualifications (RFQs), which was posted on the Authority’s web-site, invited consultants to submit Statements of Qualifications (SOQs). Fourteen (14) firms submitted SOQ’s on March 7, 2012.

Policy 303a outlines the procedure for Request for Proposal selection of consultants by the Engineering Department. The SOQ evaluation serves as a method for developing a “short list” of firms to receive a Request for Proposal (RFP). The Review Committee evaluated the SOQ’s and recommended soliciting Technical and sealed Price Proposals from the top ranked firms:

Ammann & Whitney, Inc.
H2L2 Architects/Planners, LLC
McCormick Taylor, Inc.
Michael Baker Jr., Inc.
Pennoni Associates, Inc.
Stantec Consulting Service, Inc.

The short listed firms were sent a RFP on May 8, 2012. The Technical Proposals and separate sealed Price Proposals were received on June 14, 2012 from all six firms. The Review Committee, consisting of three (3) staff engineers, reviewed and evaluated the Technical Proposals.

Ammann & Whitney was the highest technically ranked firm. The team proposed by Ammann & Whitney is well qualified and exhibited professional staff knowledgeable in the areas of bridge, architectural, and bicycle/pedestrian facility design. The firm is experienced with similar pedestrian bridge structures and modifications to large bridges. The staff proposed by Ammann & Whitney is very experienced with structural and architectural design. The project manager demonstrated 25 years of experience in the inspection and design of bridge and highway projects and the lead structural engineer has 18 years of experience in the design and rehabilitation of bridge structures. Overall, the team assembled by Ammann & Whitney was found to possess the necessary experience and qualifications to successfully complete the project.
The Review Committee recommended that the Price Proposal be opened and negotiations commence using other recommended firm’s Price Proposals and the Engineer’s Estimate in the amount of $610,257.19, as a guide. Price Proposals were opened on July 30, 2012.

Below are the Technical Proposal rankings, proposed hours and fees of these firms, along with the Engineer’s estimate of hours.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Firm</th>
<th>Hours</th>
<th>Original Price Proposal</th>
<th>Negotiated</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Engineer’s Estimate</td>
<td>4,782</td>
<td>$610,257.19</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Ammann &amp; Whitney</td>
<td>7,300</td>
<td>$822,127.12</td>
<td>5,534</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Pennoni</td>
<td>9,861</td>
<td>$1,015,716.67</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Michael Baker Jr.</td>
<td>4,890</td>
<td>$599,874.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Stantec</td>
<td>4,701</td>
<td>$533,749.17</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Price Proposal from the highest technically ranked firm, Ammann & Whitney, dated June 14, 2012 was reviewed by Engineering Department staff. It was observed to be 35% higher than the Engineer’s Estimate. Negotiations commenced which resulted in a final Price Proposal in an amount of $598,917.00. Based on the Review Committee’s findings the Price Proposal of $598,917.00 has been determined to be fair and reasonable and therefore the committee recommends that an Engineering Services Agreement be issued to the highest technically ranked firm, Ammann & Whitney.

Based on a review of the Review Committee’s evaluation and supporting documentation, I concur with the recommendation to engage Ammann & Whitney of Philadelphia, PA, in the amount of $598,917.00 for this Agreement.

:ala